

## **Evaluation of Meritocracy and Analysis of Challenges of Political Justice in Government Appointments in Iran**

Golamreza Behroozlak<sup>1</sup>   
Mortaza Amirpour<sup>2</sup>

### **1-Introduction**

In Iran, pervasive government intervention has resulted in the state assuming primary responsibility for employment. This has turned the government into a large and unsuccessful employer. In Iran, the concept of employment has not been adequately developed. When people hear the term "employment," they often think first of government jobs, which typically involve a desk and chair. The limited options available in the job market, coupled with a lack of job security and insufficient benefits in the private sector, have made government positions more appealing. As a result, there is intense competition for these limited government roles, as demand far exceeds supply. This scarcity of opportunities complicates the fair distribution of responsibilities, which is essential for effectively implementing justice. The distribution of power is a fundamental aspect of political justice and serves as a key indicator for evaluating political systems today. In Islamic political philosophy, all citizens have the right to pursue this justice, and no one should be allowed to impede their efforts.

### **2- Methodology and Conceptual Framework**

To conduct this analysis, we employed the Kolmogorov-Smirnov questionnaire survey tool, designing five specific items to gauge perceptions among a sample of 270 professors and experts in political and executive sciences.

Meritocracy, or a merit-based system, is a widely used concept in political science and governance. Literally, "merit" refers to ability,

---

<sup>1</sup> Bagheral Uloom University, Faculty of Political Sciences. behroozlak@gmail.com

<sup>2</sup> Bagheral Uloom University, Faculty of Political Science. amirpour.ir@gmail.com



adequacy, and competence. In organizational terms, meritocracy is a process where the most capable individuals are selected for specific tasks, maximizing efficiency and effectiveness. Defining a universally applicable and detailed set of criteria for competence is challenging, as these indices vary based on individual roles and responsibilities, and are shaped by the wisdom of leaders and societal customs. Thus, any attempt to define competence without considering these factors risks injustice and undermines the principles of meritocracy and political justice.

### 3- Discussion

God Almighty created everyone equal and granted them equal rights. History demonstrates that neglecting the proper distribution of power can lead to the emergence of authoritarian or decentralized governments. Power carries a complex meaning; as we ascend its pyramid, it becomes increasingly concentrated and difficult to access, with only a few individuals able to reach those heights. When individuals gain access to the upper echelons of political power, it creates unique circumstances for them that, without an effective control mechanism, can foster unfavorable conditions for society. Political justice, through its mechanisms, can establish a foundation for all members of society to attain power by dismantling monopolies on authority. However, since not everyone can simultaneously occupy political positions, political justice strives to eliminate barriers that hinder individuals from achieving power equitably. This ensures that anyone with the competence and capability can rise to these positions, even if they are not part of the existing power structure.

Thus, it is essential to employ the most qualified individuals while upholding the principles of equality and the right to be selected. Meritocracy, closely linked to efficiency, is vital for the sustainability of the political system; its absence can lead to a legitimacy crisis within that system. Consequently, the significance of evaluating the meritocracy component in achieving political justice becomes increasingly evident.

Given the absence of statistical measures to assess the current state of the meritocracy component in the country's selection system, this

study aims to evaluate this issue by identifying its strengths and weaknesses. Utilizing Charles Jones' sequential method, we first define the problem and subsequently analyze it from a political perspective. It is crucial to understand the current performance of the government before determining how it should ideally function.

The five survey items were as follows:

- The current selection criteria have been successful in preventing corruption and inefficiency;
- In our society, jobs are assigned based on merit;
- Incorporating individual justice in selection processes has effectively mitigated corruption;
- The use of quotas in appointments is unrelated to the merit or incompetence of individuals;
- When choosing between specialization and commitment, specialization takes precedence.

#### **4- Conclusion and Suggestions**

The results from this survey and subsequent data analysis provide a comprehensive overview of the status of the competency component within the selection system. Findings indicate that the current conditions are moderate to low, highlighting significant challenges .facing political justice in this area

The existing models for identifying qualified individuals within the Islamic Republic are both inadequate and ineffective. To safeguard against the inefficiencies and corruption stemming from these shortcomings, it is imperative for the Islamic Republic to revise its evaluation models for assessing the competence of selected individuals. This revision should leverage the capabilities of all societal members to further its objectives. Neglecting this issue has led to detrimental consequences for the system's efficiency, potentially plunging the Islamic Revolution into a crisis of legitimacy. Consequently, the principle of political justice necessitates that the agents of the Islamic Republic of Iran abandon non-virtuous practices in favor of their intellectual principles. This shift is essential for ensuring that positions are distributed equitably among society's members and that individuals can attain roles based on merit and competence. Furthermore, the

political system must commit to continuously monitoring its agents and dismissing those who demonstrate incompetence.

## 5- References

### Quran

### Nahj al-Balagha

- Ahmad A.R. (2000). Political justice in the Alevi government. *Mashhad: Negah HozeH Publications*. (65) 13-19. **[In Persain]**
- Ashuri, M., Bashirieh, H. (2015). Human rights and concepts of equality, fairness and justice. Tehran: Khorsandi Publications. **[In Persain]**
- Dehkhoda A. A. (1999) Dictionary of Dehkhoda. Tehran: University of Tehran Printing and Publishing Institute, Volume 12. **[In Persain]**
- Haqit, S.S. (1998). Principles of Political Justice. Scientific Research Quarterly of Review and Comment, 2 and 3. **[In Persain]**
- Houshmand H. (2014). Social justice and public policy making in contemporary liberalism. This morning's newspaper. Available on the site: <http://shahrvand-newspaper.ir/News/Main/13421>
- Jardagh G. (2016). Imam Ali, peace be upon him, the voice of humanity's justice, translated by Seyedhadadi Khosrowshahi. Qom: Publication of Imam Asr (AS), volume 1. **[In Persain]**
- Javadi Amoli Abdullah (2019) Philosophy of Human Rights. Qom: Esra Publications. **[In Persain]**
- Javadi Amoli, A. (2024). Tasnim, Qom: Esra Publications, Volume 2. **[In Persain]**
- Khamenei, S A, collection of statements and speeches, accessible on the website: <https://farsi.khamenei.ir/speech>
- Majlisi M T, (1979). Bihar al-Anwar, Beirut: Al-Wafa Institute Publishing, Volume 45. **[In Persain]**
- Majlisi M T. (1982). Bihar al-Anwar, Beirut: Al-Wafa Institute Publishing, Volume 21. **[In Persain]**
- Maulana H, Lakzaei N, Akhwan Kazemi B, Sadra A. (2004). Mahdavi political justice. Qom: The Promised Expectation Publishing House. 13 (4) 61-92. **[In Persain]**
- Mir Hosseini M (2016). Master's Thesis: Investigating the level of sense of political justice among the third generation of the revolution) Supervisor: Mohammad Reza Taliban, Adviser: Seyed Mohammad Mirsandsi, Research Institute of Imam Khomeini (RA) and the Islamic Revolution. **[In Persain]**
- Mohagheq Damad S M. (2009). Justice in Islamic theology and social system, an introduction to the political theory of justice in Islam. Tehran: Publishing House of Imam Sadegh University. **[In Persain]**
- Mohammadi Zia A. (2021). The challenges of the efficiency of the political system of the Islamic Republic of Iran in realizing political justice: strategies and solutions. Qom: Bagheral Uloom University Press. **[In Persain]**
- Moin M. (2008). Farhang Farsi Moin Tehran: Zarin Publishing House. **[In Persain]**
- Motahari, M. (2017). Collection of works. Tehran: Sadra Publishing House, Volume 21. **[In Persain]**
- Motahari, M. (2018). Society and history. Tehran: Sadra Publications. **[In Persain]**
- Naini M H. (2015). Tanbiyeh al-Uma and Tanziyeh al-Molla, Qom: Publication of Bostan Kitab Institute.

### Crisis Studies of the Islamic World

- Nowrozi Chakli, A. (2013). Familiarity with scientometrics: basics, concepts, relationships and roots. Tehran: Publication of Organization for Studying and Compiling Humanities Books of Universities. **[In Persain]**
- Paketchi, A. (2022). Finding the components of political justice in Islamic texts, an introduction to the theory of political justice in Islam. Tehran: Publications of the Research Center for Cultural and Social Studies. **[In Persain]**
- Ragheb E, Hossein bin M. (2009) Al-Mufardat fi Gharib al-Qur'an. Qom: Mortazavi Publishing House, Volume 1. **[In Persain]**
- Rashid R (1990). Tafsir al-Manar. Egypt: Publication of the Egyptian General Society of Books, Volume 2. **[In Persain]**
- Rawls, J (2010) Theory of Justice, translated by Seyed Mohd Kamal Sarwarian and Morteza Bahrani. Tehran: Publishing House of Cultural and Social Studies. **[In Persain]**
- Seyed Bagheri S K. (2014) Political Justice, Tehran: Islamic Culture and Thought Research Institute Publishing Organization. **[In Persain]**
- Seyed Bagheri, S. K. and Mukhtarband, M (2017) Principles of standardization in political justice. Studies of Iranian Islamic development model. No. 10. 109 -89. **[In Persain]**
- Tabatabaei, S M H. (2000) Al-Mizan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an. Tehran: Amir Kabir Publishing House, Volume 1. **[In Persain]**
- Tabatabai, S M H. (2000), translation of Tafsir al-Mizan, translator: Seyyed Mohammad Baqer Mousavihamdani, Tehran: Amirkabir Publishing House, vol. 12. **[In Persain]**
- Tousi M B H, Al-Amali (2009), translated by Sadegh Hassanzadeh, Qom: Andisheh Hadi Publishing House. **[In Persain]**